



The Result of Contemplation on the Issue of Voiced Remembrance and Invocation¹

By *Imām Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī* ﷺ

Translated by Yaser Rad²

Released by www.marifah.net 1429 H

Issue:

All praises and thanks are due to Allah & He suffices; peace be upon His chosen servants. You asked, may Allah honor you, concerning the *sūfī* practice of setting up circles in the *masājīd* for the purpose of *dhikr*, in particular the raising of their voices when reciting *Lā ilāha illā Allah*. Is this (practice) hated or disliked (*makrūh*) or otherwise?

Answer:

In fact, there is nothing disliked in it at all. Many statements of the Prophet ﷺ have actually suggested that open and loud *dhikr* (*al jahr bi al-dhikr*) is preferred. There are also those *aḥādīth* that justify silent *dhikr*. Both these views are correct in relation to the varying nature of individuals. Along the same lines, Imām Al-Nawawī has put forward both kinds of *aḥādīth* in which support the open recitation of the Holy Qur’ān and those that support quiet recitation. I will expound upon this issue piece by piece.

Aḥādīth which authoritatively and clearly point to the preference of loud *dhikr*

1. It is related in the *Ṣaḥīḥ* of Imām Bukhārī³ that Abū Hurayrah ﷺ narrates that the Prophet ﷺ said: “Allah says, ‘I am towards My servant as he is towards Me. I

¹ Al-Suyūṭī, Jalāl Al-Dīn. “*Natījatu al-Fikri Fi al-Jahr Fi al-Dhikr*.” Al-Ḥawī Al-Fatāwā. Ed. Khālid Turtūsī. Beirut: Dār Al-Kutub Al-‘Arabī, 2005. 399-405.

² Please forgive any errors and keep the lowly servant in your du’ās. I am also indebted and grateful to an earlier translation by Sajeda Maryam Poswal of a commentary done by Shaykh Abū Anīs Muḥammad Barkat ‘Alī Ludhianwī.

³ Also can be found in the *Ṣaḥīḥ* of Imām Muslim (2675) on the authority of Abū Hurayrah

am with him when he remembers Me. If he remembers Me within himself, I remember him within Myself. If he remembers Me in a gathering, I remember him in a gathering better than it.” *Dhikr* made in a gathering can only be aloud.⁴

2. It is reported by Bazzār and Imām Ḥākim⁵ in his *Mustadrak*⁶ that it is narrated on the authority of Jābir ؓ who said: “The Messenger of Allah ﷺ came to us and said, ‘O people! Allah has a group of angels in His service who descend and join gatherings of *dhikr* upon the Earth. So graze well from the gardens of Paradise. We asked, ‘And where are the gardens of Paradise?’ He ﷺ replied, ‘Gatherings of *dhikr*. So occupy yourselves in the remembrance of Allah in the morning and in the evening.’”
3. It is narrated in the *Ṣaḥīḥ* of Imām Muslim⁷ and by Ḥākim that it is narrated on the authority of Abū Hurayrah ؓ that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said: “Allah has appointed angels whose sole purpose is to wander around in search of the gatherings of *dhikr* upon the earth. When they arrive at a gathering of *dhikr*, they join in. They gather (in such numbers) that their wings cover each other until they reach the Heavens.⁸ Then afterwards, Allah asks of them,⁹ ‘Where have you come from?’ They reply, ‘We have come from your servants who are declaring You free of all imperfections, magnifying You, praising You and exalting Your name. They pray to You and seek Your protection.’ ‘And what do they pray for?’ They answer, ‘They pray for Paradise.’ He says, ‘Have they seen it?’ They reply, ‘Our Lord, no.’ Allah asks, ‘How would they be had they seen it?’ Then He asks, ‘And from what do they seek My protection?’¹⁰ Though He knew better than them. They reply, ‘From the fire.’ He asks, ‘And have they seen it?’ They say ‘No.’ He continues, ‘What if they had seen it?’ Then he says, ‘Bear witness that I have forgiven them, granted them their request and saved them from what they fear.’ The angels beseech, ‘Our Lord.’ There is among them a sinful man who is not from them and happened to sit with them.’ To this Allah replies, ‘I have also forgiven him for they are such people that in their presence no hardship is inflicted.’”
4. Muslim and Tirmidhī narrate that it is narrated on the authority of Abū Hurayrah ؓ and Abū Sa’īd ؓ who heard the Messenger of Allah ﷺ saying: “No group of people who occupy themselves in the remembrance of Allah Almighty are left

⁴ Imām Suyūṭī is explaining that there is no reason for ḥadīth to have the extra wording ‘in a gathering’ if it is done in a silent fashion, otherwise it is equivalent to the wording ‘within himself.’ Therefore the mention can only be out loud in a gathering, thus his addition of ‘it can only be aloud’ (*lā yakūna illā ‘an jahri*)

⁵ And he considered its chain to be rigorously authenticated.

⁶ It is also narrated by Abū Ya’lā, Bazzār, Ṭabarānī in *Al-Awsat*. Similar to it is found in Majma’ al-Zawā’id.

⁷ Book of Remembrance, Invocations, Repentance & Forgiveness

⁸ *Samā*

⁹ Imām Suyūṭī adds: Though he knows better than them.

¹⁰ Imām Suyūṭī adds: Allah asks, though he knows better than them.

without being joined by the angels. They are showered with mercy and tranquility descends upon them and Allah mentions them to those who are close to him.”

5. Imām Muslim and Imām Tirmidhī narrate that it is narrated by Mu’āwiya ؓ that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ came across a circle of his companions and asked: “What made you sit here?” They replied: “We are sitting here in order to make remembrance of Allah and to praise Him.” The Holy Prophet ﷺ said: “Indeed Jibrīl has come to me and informed me that Allah is well pleased with you and boasts¹¹ of you to the angels.”
6. Ḥākīm narrates in his *Mustadrak*¹² & Bayhaqī narrates in his *Shu’ab al-Imān* that it is narrated by Abū Sa’īd Al-Khudrī ؓ that the Messenger ﷺ said: “Increase in the *dhikr* of Allah until they call you mad.”¹³
7. Bayhaqī narrates in his *Shu’ab al-Imān* that it is narrated on the authority of Abū Jowzā ؓ that the Messenger ﷺ said: “Increase in the *dhikr* of Allah (so much) until the hypocrites say to you, ‘You are doing this for show.’” This is a *mursal* ḥadīth.

It is evident from this ḥadīth and the one before it that others can only say these statements when they hear *dhikr* done loudly not silently.

8. Bayhaqī relates that it is narrated on the authority of Anas ؓ that the Messenger ﷺ said: “When you pass the gardens of Paradise graze well from them.” They asked: “O Messenger of Allah ﷺ ! What are the gardens of Paradise?” He replied: “The gatherings of *dhikr*.”
9. Baqī b. Mukhlad ؓ narrates on the authority of Abdullah b. ‘Amr ؓ that the Prophet ﷺ passed by two sessions. One of them was calling upon Allah with sincere aching and want while the other was seeking knowledge. The Holy Prophet ﷺ said: “Both are full of goodness, yet one is better than the other.”
10. Bayhaqī relates that ‘Abdullāh b. Mughfil ؓ said that the Messenger ﷺ said: “There is no group of people who gather together only for the purpose of sincere *dhikr* of Allah except that an angel announces to them from the Heavens, ‘All of you are forgiven. Your bad deeds have been replaced by good deeds.’”¹⁴

¹¹ ‘Boasts’ in this context is in a non-negative sense; He is proud of them. It is important to note that the audience is the angels – creatures unable to sin and thought of as amongst the best of creation. However making *dhikr* in this fashion raises them above the angels and this is why Allah boasts to the angels, and Allah knows best.

¹² And he considers the chain rigorously authenticated

¹³ It is also found in the Ṣaḥīḥ of Ibn Hibbān and in the Musnad of Imām Aḥmad.

¹⁴ Sh. Ludhianwī (in his commentary) adds that this ḥadīth is also found in the Musnad of Imām Aḥmad and Ṭabarānī with the chain going through Suhail b. Hanẓalah (al-Targhīb wa al-Tarhīb)

11. Bayhaqī relates that it is narrated by Abū Saʿīd ؓ that the Prophet ﷺ said: “The Lord, most high, will say on the Day of Resurrection: ‘Those gathered today will now know who are *Ahl al-Karam* (the People of Nobility).’” The Companions asked: “Who are the *Ahl al-Karam*, O Messenger of Allah ﷺ ?” He replied: “Those who attend the gatherings of *dhikr* in the *masjid*.”¹⁵
12. Bayhaqī relates that it is narrated by Ibn Masʿūd ؓ that mountains call one another by their name saying: “O so and so! Did someone pass you today making remembrance of Allah?” When it says ‘Yes’, the other rejoices. Then Abdullah b. Masʿūd ؓ recited the following verses:

﴿لَقَدْ جِئْتُمْ شَيْئًا إِذَا
تَكَادُ السَّمَاوَاتُ يَتَفَطَّرْنَ مِنْهُ وَتَنْشَقُّ الْأَرْضُ وَتَخِرُّ الْجِبَالُ هَدًا
أَنْ دَعَوْا لِلرَّحْمَنِ وَلَدًا﴾

*Indeed you have brought forth a terrible thing
The heavens are almost torn, the earth split asunder, the mountains fall in ruin
(since they say) That they ascribe to the Most Merciful, a son*¹⁶

‘Abdullāh b. Masʿūd ؓ continued and asked: “If the mountains hear evil, do they also not hear good?”¹⁷

13. Ibn Jarīr states in his *tafsīr* that Ibn ‘Abbās ؓ interpreted the following verses:

﴿فَمَا بَكَتْ عَلَيْهِمُ السَّمَاءُ وَالْأَرْضُ وَمَا كَانُوا مُنْظَرِينَ﴾

*And neither heaven nor earth shed a tear over them
(i.e. Pharaoh and his army.) And they were not from those given respite.*¹⁸

And he ؓ said: “When a Believer dies, the place on the earth, in which he used to pray and remember Allah, mourns him.” Ibn Abī al-Dunya relates from Abū ‘Ubayd ؓ: “Indeed when the Believer dies, parts of the earth cry out (to the sky): ‘Abdullāh, a believer has died!’ Upon hearing this both the earth and the sky begin to weep. The Most Merciful asks: ‘Why do you both weep for my servant?’ They reply: ‘Our Lord! Whenever he passed by us, he wouldn’t do so except that which he made remembrance of You.’”

¹⁵ Also found in the *Ṣaḥīḥ* of Ibn Hibbān (3/89) and a similar ḥadīth on the authority of Abū Saʿīd in Bayhaqī’s *Shuʿab al-Imān*.

¹⁶ Qurʾān 19:89-91

¹⁷ Shaykh Ludhianwī adds that this narration can be found in: Bayhaqī’s *Shuʿab al-Imān*, *Tafsīr Faṭḥ al-Qadīr* and ‘Abdullāh b. Mubārak’s *al-Zuhd wa al-Riqāq*

¹⁸ Qurʾān 44:29

The evidence that the mountain and the earth hear the remembrance can only be valid when *dhikr* is done aloud.

14. Bazzār and Bayhaqī have mentioned via a sound chain of authorities from Ibn ‘Abbās ؓ who heard the Holy Prophet ﷺ to have quoted Allah in saying: “My servant, if you remember Me in seclusion, I will remember you in seclusion. If you remember My name in a gathering, I will mention you in a better gathering.”
15. Bayhaqī reports on the authority of Zaid b. Aslam ؓ who relates from Ibn Al-Adra’ ؓ as saying: “I went with the Holy Prophet ﷺ one night when he ﷺ passed by a man in the *masjid* who was raising his voice and I said, ‘O Messenger of Allah ﷺ! Maybe he is doing this for show.’ He ﷺ replied, ‘No, rather he is only expressing his feelings.’”¹⁹

Bayhaqī also reports on the authority of Aqba b. ‘Āmir that the Messenger ﷺ said of a man known as Dhul Bajādain, who was also exclaiming in his *dhikr*, and the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said “Indeed, he is only expressing his emotions” (*innahū awāhu*).

Bayhaqī also reports on the authority of Jābir b. ‘Abdullāh ؓ that a man used to raise his voice in the remembrance of Allah. On hearing him someone said: “If only he would lower his voice.” To this the Holy Prophet ﷺ said: “Leave him for he is only expressing his feelings.”

16. Ḥākīm relates that it is narrated on the authority of Shaddād b. Aws ؓ who said: “We were in the presence of the Holy Prophet ﷺ when he said, ‘Raise your hands and say: *Lā ilāha illa Allah!*’ We did this. The Holy Prophet ﷺ prayed thus: ‘O Allah the Almighty, you have indeed sent me with this blessed word, command me in accordance with it, and promise me paradise on account of it. Indeed You never break promises.’ He then said, ‘Be pleased to hear that Allah has forgiven you all.’”
17. Bazzār²⁰ narrates that Anas ؓ narrates that the Holy Prophet ﷺ said: “Indeed Allah has wandering group of angels, searching out sessions of *dhikr*. When they find such gatherings, they surround them with their wings. Allah commands them: ‘Wash them with My mercy for they are such people in whose presence none can be harmed.’”

¹⁹ The verb is *awāha*, literally to make the *ah* sound, equivalent in English as saying, “Oh!” or “Ah!” when one is relieved or distressed.

²⁰ Majma’ al-Zawā’id says it is also found in the Musnad of Aḥmad and in Ṭabarānī and all the narrators are trustworthy.

18. Ṭabarānī & Ibn Jarīr narrate on the authority of ‘Abd al-Raḥmān b. Sahl b. Ḥanīf ؓ who said “Allah revealed upon the Prophet ﷺ the verse when he was in one of his houses:

﴿وَاصْبِرْ نَفْسَكَ مَعَ الَّذِينَ يَدْعُونَ رَبَّهُمْ بِالْعَدَاةِ وَالْعَشِيِّ يُرِيدُونَ وَجْهَهُ وَلَا تَعْدُ عَيْنَاكَ عَنْهُمْ تُرِيدُ زِينَةَ الْحَيَاةِ الدُّنْيَا وَلَا تُطِعْ مَنْ أَغْفَلْنَا قَلْبَهُ عَن ذِكْرِنَا وَاتَّبَعَ هَوَاهُ وَكَانَ أَمْرُهُ قَرْطًا﴾

And be content with those call their lord in the morning and in the evening, wanting him and don't look pass them, wanting the glitter of the life of the world and don't obey him who is heedless of Us in their heart, without dhikr of Us and who follow their desires and whose affairs has exceeded [past redemption]²¹

So the Prophet ﷺ left [his house] in order to find them and he found a people who were making remembrance of Allah The Most High. Amongst them were ones who had disheveled hair and ones who were very thin and those whose clothes consisted only of one white cloth. So when he saw them, he ﷺ sat with them and he ﷺ said ‘All praise and thanks belong to Allah, who made in my *ummah* (such people) and ordered me to be content with them.’”

19. Imām Aḥmad narrates in *al-Zuhd* on the authority of Thābit ؓ who said “Salmān²² ؓ was deep in the remembrance of Allah when the Prophet ﷺ passed and said ‘What are you all saying?’ We said ‘We are remembering Allah.’ He said ‘Indeed I saw the mercy (of Allah) descend upon you and I would love to join you all in it [the *dhikr* of Allah].’ Then He ﷺ said ‘All praise and thanks belong to Allah who has made (such people) in my *ummah* and who has ordered me to be content with them.’”
20. Al-Aṣbahānī narrates in *al-Targhib* on the authority of Abū Razīn al-‘Aqīlī that: Indeed the Messenger ﷺ said to someone “Should I not tell you upon what framework all good in this life and in the hereafter is built upon?” He said “Yes, of course.” He ﷺ said “Stick firmly to the gatherings of *dhikr*! If you are alone, then keep moving your tongue in the *dhikr* of Allah.”
21. Ibn Abī Dunyā and al-Bayhaqī and al-Aṣbahānī narrate on the authority of Anas ؓ who said: The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said “For me to sit with the people who make remembrance of Allah after the *ṣalāh* of *ṣubḥ* (*fajr*) until the sun has risen is more beloved to me than all which the sun shines upon and for me to sit with the people who make remembrance of Allah after the *ṣalāh* of ‘*aṣr* until the sun sets is more beloved to me than the world and whatever is in it.

²¹ Qur’ān 18:28

²² Salmān Al-Fārsī

22. The *shaykhān*²³ narrate that Ibn ‘Abbās ؓ said “Indeed the sound of *dhikr* became loud when the people had completed their proscribed prayers during the time of the Prophet ﷺ.” Ibn ‘Abbās added “I would know when they had completed their prayer when I could hear them.”
23. Ḥākim narrates that ‘Umar b. Khattāb narrates that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said “Whomsoever enters the market and then says ‘*Lā ilāha illa Allah waḥdahū lā sharīka lahu, lahu al-mulk ,wa lahu al-ḥamdu yuḥīyī wa yumītu wa huwa ‘alā kullī shay’in qadīr*’²⁴, Allah will write for him one million good deeds and will erase one million of his bad deeds and will raise him one million levels and will build for him a house in *Jannah*.” And in some other narrations it is added “and Allah will call him.”
24. Aḥmad and Abū Dawūd and Tirmidhī, who considered it rigorously authenticated, and Nisā’ī and Ibn Mājah narrates that Sā’ib ؓ narrates that the Messenger of Allah ﷺ said “Jibrīl came to me and he said: Your Companions should raise their voices with the *takbīr*²⁵ when they walk.”
25. Murūzī narrates in the Book of the Two ‘*Eids* that Mujāhid narrates that ‘Abdullāh b. ‘Umar ؓ and Abū Hurayrah ؓ would come into the market during the ten days (of *Dhul Ḥijjah*) and would make *takbīr* loudly and would not leave the market until everyone did so as well.

Also, it is narrated that ‘Ubaid b. ‘Umair said “‘Umar ؓ would make *takbīr* loudly in his tent so the people of the *masjid* and the people of the market would also make *takbīr* loudly so much so that all of Mina would shake with *takbīrs*.

It is also narrated that Maymūn b. Mahrān said “I found the people making *takbīr* on the tenth (of *Dhul Ḥijjah*) so much that it echoed like the waves due to its great number.”

Conclusion

If you were to reflect upon the narrations given, you would know that loud *dhikr* is not from amongst the forbidden or disliked acts. But rather the evidence seems to imply, either explicitly or implicitly, that loud *dhikr* is among the preferred acts of worship. As for the narrations that speak of the benefits of silent *dhikr* and using those as arguments against loud *dhikr*; these narrations are analogous to making an argument of reciting

²³ Bukhārī & Muslim

²⁴ There is none worthy of worship except Allah. The One, having no partners whatsoever. To Him belong the entire dominion and all praise. He brings life and brings death and He is over all things powerful.

²⁵ In the Ṣaḥīḥ of Ibn Khuzaymah and the Ṣaḥīḥ of Ibn Hibbān and others the word *tahlīl* and *talbiyah* was used instead.

Qur'ān silently over reciting loudly. The case being that silent recitation is compared with giving charity in secret while loud recitation is giving charity in public.²⁶

Al-Nawawī has concluded that silent recitation is more meritorious when there is a fear of ostentation or when those around you are praying or sleeping and it is more meritorious to read loudly in all other situations because it can cause listeners to do good works and bring benefit to those who are listening. It also awakens the heart of the one who is reciting, gives him concentration and causes him to think about the words spoken. Furthermore it removes his drowsiness and increases his alertness. Some also say that is preferred to do part of the recitation loudly while other parts silently. This is because it is elating for one, after becoming tired with silent recitation, to recite loudly. Also, it is relaxing for one to begin to recite silently after reciting loudly for some time.

The same points that Al-Nawawī has brought up in his discussion of the superiority of loud or quiet recitation can also be applied to our discussion (on *dhikr*) and they can be concluded from the various *aḥādīth* that were mentioned.

And if they²⁷ say that Allah, most exalted, says:

﴿وَاذْكُرْ رَبَّكَ فِي نَفْسِكَ تَضَرُّعًا وَخَفِيَّةً وَدُونَ الْجَهْرِ مِنَ الْقَوْلِ﴾

*And remember your Lord within yourself, with humility and in secret,
and without being loud with your words*²⁸

The answer to using this ayah can be summed up in three points:

First: This verse is Makkī as is this verse:

﴿وَلَا تَجْهَرُ بِصَلَاتِكَ وَلَا تُخَافِتُ بِهَا﴾

*Do not raise your voice in your salāh nor offer it in silence*²⁹

This verse was revealed at a time when the Prophet ﷺ would raise his voice when he would recite the Qur'ān and it would give reason for the pagans to insult the Qur'ān and the one who sent it: Allah, Most Exalted. So it was ordered for him ﷺ to leave his practice and lower his voice so that pagans would not continue their practice. Similarly it was forbidden by Allah, most exalted, to not insult their idols in the verse:

﴿وَلَا تَسُبُّوا الَّذِينَ يَدْعُونَ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فَيَسُبُّوا اللَّهَ عَدْوًا بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ﴾

²⁶ Imām Suyūfī is drawing the parallel argument to show the absurdity of making such an argument. Nobody claims that loud recitation of Qur'ān is forbidden because the silent form is superior.

²⁷ Those who hold loud *dhikr* to be impermissible

²⁸ Qur'ān 7:205

²⁹ Qur'ān 17:110

And do not insult those that they call upon besides Allah, or they may do the same to Allah and become enemies with Allah without any knowledge (or any intention of doing so)³⁰

This command was abrogated later on (as the situation improved) and this can be found in the exegesis of this verse by Ibn Kathīr.

Second: A group of the exegetes, from them namely ‘Abd al-Raḥmān b. Zayd b. Aslam – the teacher of Imām Mālik – and Ibn Jarīr held that the ayah in reference to the *dhākir* was specifically in reference to when Qur’ān is being recited. The command in this regard is that the Qur’ān be read in a raised voice that is audible, drawing upon the verse:

﴿وَإِذَا قُرِئَ الْقُرْآنُ فَاسْتَمِعُوا لَهُ وَأَنْصِتُوا لَعَلَّكُمْ تُرْحَمُونَ﴾

And when the Qur’ān is being recited, then pay attention to it and remain silent so that you may receive mercy.³¹

If one is under the impression that this order to silence is indefinite and this allows people to be lazy and use this as an excuse to avoid making loud *dhikr*, then it can be clearly explained that the purpose of the order to be quiet is in order for the heart to make remembrance of Allah (while the Qur’ān is recited) so that it does not become heedless of Allah³², as is clear by the ending of the ayah:

﴿وَلَا تَكُن مِّنَ الْغَافِلِينَ﴾

And do not be from those who are heedless³³

Third: The *Sūfīs* say that this verse is specific (*khāss*) for the Prophet ﷺ, the Perfected Exemplar and not aimed at others. As for those besides the Prophets, they are in state in which the whispers of devils and wrong thoughts have sway over them and making loud *dhikr* is a strong method in neutralizing these evils.

(I say that:) This is further strengthened by ḥadīth found in Bazzār, on the authority of Mu’adh b. Jabal ؓ who said: The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said: “Whoever prays from amongst you in the night, then he should recite in a raised voice, because then the angels pray with him and listen to the recitation. If there are believing jinn present where he is praying, then they pray with him as well and

³⁰ Qur’ān 6:108

³¹ Qur’ān 7:204

³² Not in order to make loud *dhikr* impermissible altogether.

³³ Qur’ān 7:205

listen with attention. For indeed loud recitation encircles the one reciting and those around him and drives the troublemakers and the most evil of the jinn away.”

Then if you are to say that indeed Allah Most High says:

﴿ادْعُوا رَبَّكُمْ تَضَرُّعًا وَخَفِيَةً إِنَّهُ لَا يُحِبُّ الْمُعْتَدِينَ﴾

***Call upon your Lord with humility and quietly,
Indeed He does not love the transgressors***³⁴

And isn't it the case that *i'tidā'* (transgression) is interpreted as the raising of the voice while one is supplicating? The answer to this is twofold:

- (1) Firstly, the sounder interpretation of this matter is that transgression is in reference to the one who has exceeded what has been commanded in prayer or it is a supplication that has been invented with no basis in the *sharī'ah* and this is supported from the narration in Ibn Mājah and in al-Ḥākim in his Mustadrak³⁵, in which Abū Ni'āmah narrates that 'Abdullāh b. Mughfil ؓ heard his son say “ ‘Oh Allah I ask you for a white palace on the right side of Paradise.’ He responded: ‘Verily I heard the Messenger of Allah ﷺ say: “There will be in this *ummah* people who transgress bounds in making supplication.”’ So this was the interpretation of my Companion in what constituted transgression in supplication and he knows better by what he meant.
- (2) Secondly, even if one was to submit to their argument, then the verse is referring specifically to *du'ā'* and not to *dhikr*. By its very nature, *du'ā'* is more meritorious in secret and more likely to be answered in this manner as Allah, most exalted, gives us the example (of how Zakariyyah made *du'ā'*):

﴿إِذْ نَادَى رَبَّهُ نِدَاءً خَفِيًّا﴾

When he (Zacharias) cried to his Lord, a secret call³⁶

It is for this reason that *isti'adhā'*³⁷ is preferred to be made quietly during *salāh* because it is a *du'ā'*.

Lastly, if you say: “Isn't there is a narration in which Ibn Mas'ūd ؓ saw people making *tahlīl*³⁸ with a raised voice in the masjid and he ؓ said: ‘I do not see you all except as innovators!’ until he expelled them from the masjid?”

³⁴ Qur'ān 7:55

³⁵ In which he graded it as rigorously authentic (*Ṣaḥīḥ*)

³⁶ Qur'ān 19:3

³⁷ The act of seeking refuge in Allah (from shaytān) said in *ṣalāh* [‘*Audhu billāhi min al-shaytāni rajīm*’]

This narration of Ibn Mas'ūd ؓ is in need of a clear chain of narrators (i.e. it lacks a good *sanad*). More importantly, who has used this narration from amongst the leading masters³⁹ of *aḥādīth* in their books?⁴⁰ And if this problem could be fixed, it would go against a large number of *aḥādīth* stating otherwise and the many are given priority over this lone narration. It is also inconsistent with another narration of Ibn Mas'ūd ؓ because it is narrated from Imām Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal in *al-Zuhd* from Hussain b. Muḥammad from Mas'ūdi on the authority 'Āmir b. Shaqīq that Abū Wā'il said: "There are those who think that 'Abdullāh (b. Mas'ūd) has forbidden *dhikr*! Never did he sit in a gathering except that I found him making the *dhikr* of Allah."

I close from Imām Aḥmad's *al-Zuhd* again that Thābit al-Banānī said: "Indeed the people of remembrance of Allah surely are where there is the remembrance of Allah and if they enter with mountain of sins or similar to it but they stay with those who make the *dhikr* of Allah, most Exalted, then not a single sin will be left upon them."



³⁸ The act of saying '*Lā ilāha illā Allāh*'

³⁹ *Ḥuffāz*

⁴⁰ In other words, this is not a narration that has been relied upon by the masters of the field.